

**Road Map and Implementation Strategy for
Research and Analysis
for
Gender Responsive Budgeting Initiative**

Government of Pakistan
Finance Division
Gender Responsive Budgeting Initiative (GRBI)

CONTENTS

	Introduction	1
1	Gender-aware policy appraisal	3
2	Time use survey	3
3	Beneficiary assessment	5
4	Gender-aware budget submissions in response to the Budget Call letter	6
5	Gender budget statements	7
6	Gender-aware macro-economic model	9
7	Gender-aware public expenditure tracking survey	9
8	Benefit incidence analysis	10
9	Scan of budget and related reform processes	11
10	Unpacking the budget	12
11	Analysis of civil service employment	12

INTRODUCTION

In mid-2005 the Ministry of Finance of the Government of Pakistan launched the country's Gender-responsive Budgeting Initiative (GRBI). The GRBI is being supported by the United Nations Development Programme (UNDP) Pakistan and its cost-sharing donors. The overall aims of the GRBI are to develop skills to prepare, review and analyse budgets using a gender lens, to promote policy and resource allocation with a gender perspective, and to build the advocacy skills of the Government of Pakistan and civil society organisations for gender budgeting.

The GRBI project was conceptualised as comprising five stages, namely: (a) awareness raising; (b) training and capacity building of stakeholders; (c) gender analysis of the priority sectors; (d) review of the research; and (e) advocacy. This document presents a road map and implementation strategy for the third and fourth steps of research and analysis and review. In practice, the five steps will not happen strictly sequentially and there are not always clear lines between the different areas of activity. The document thus includes, in particular, some aspects of capacity building, namely the capacity building that will be necessary for the various actors to carry out the research and analysis. This capacity will not necessarily take the form of workshops.

The document reflects the thinking of the project as at August 2005. It is based on input received from documents provided by project staff, intense discussions with project staff and others, and three workshops. Planning of gender budgeting work needs to be flexible as later steps need to be based on the outcomes of the earlier steps as well as any changes in context that might occur. The document thus provides more detail about activities to be undertaken in the following twelve months than on activities beyond that time.

The activities are planned with a strong focus on outputs i.e. on what the GRBI would like to have achieved by the end of its life. In discussions with project staff, the key outputs were seen to include:

- Gender budget statements produced by government
- Gender incorporated into line ministry responses to the budget call circular
- Some (probably) small changes in allocations, likely not to be in first year
- Research outputs with expand knowledge about the gender impact of the government budget.

An overall principle informing the plans are that the GRBI should focus on mainstream policy and budgets rather than gender-specific programmes and projects. While the latter should not be ignored, greater weight will be attached to the impact of general allocations on women and men, girls and boys.

A second principle underlying the plans is that wherever possible the GRBI should promote institutionalisation of what it is doing, so that the planned activities are not done on a once-off basis.

The research and analysis will focus on the expenditure rather than the revenue side of the budget as there is limited revenue specific to the three chosen focus sectors of Health, Education and Population.

The rest of the document describes each 'tool' one at a time. For each tool it gives the overall objectives, suggested steps, and some explanatory notes. All tools included in the project document are discussed in this document except for the sample survey to measure household expenditure patterns and variations in expenditure prioritisation within the household. In discussion it was agreed that such a survey did not directly relate to gender budgeting, which focuses on government rather than household budgets.

1. GENDER-AWARE POLICY APPRAISAL

Objective

The gender-aware policy appraisal is intended to provide an 'environmental scan' of the three sectors which are the focus of the GRBI, namely Education, Health and Population.

Activities

- Complete terms of reference (TORs)
- Appoint researchers
- Appoint reference group consisting of government sector people and sector and gender people from civil society
- Half-day session for researchers facilitated by National Expert on how to read budgets
- Review of research outlines for plans
- Mid-term review workshop of researchers and reference group
- Review of final drafts
- Dissemination workshop

Explanatory note

The policy appraisals are a priority activity as they will inform several of the other activities. The researchers should be appointed as early as possible in the fourth quarter of 2005 and the appraisals completed within four months, i.e. early in the first quarter of 2006.

'Sector' is understood as referring to the relevant Ministry at the federal and provincial levels, and the associated departments at district level. The policy appraisal will cover all three levels. It will cover the first four of the five steps of gender budget analysis and the fifth step (impact) to a limited extent. The analysis will cover both the recurrent and development budget.

The work will be outsourced. The basis for the terms of reference and the feasibility of the planned approach were laid at the workshop discussion on the afternoon of Thursday 13 August.

The researchers will be supported and monitored throughout the process.

2. TIME USE SURVEY

Objective

The time use survey will provide detailed information on the different activity patterns of women and men, girls and boys. This is important:

- for detailed policy purposes as these differences influence needs and thus how policy and budgets should respond;
- to provide data for valuation of unpaid care work i.e. an indication as to how much gross domestic product (GDP) would increase if this was included; and
- to provide data for macro modelling and satellite accounts.

Note: Macro modelling and satellite accounts will probably not be included in GRBI activities. One important reason for the proposed exclusion is that the time use survey will only be completed towards the very end of the project period and both macro modelling and satellite accounts require some time. The time use survey will nevertheless provide all the data that are necessary for these two activities.

Activities

- Preparation of short proposal to Federal Bureau of Statistics (FBS) on the time use survey
- Obtaining agreement from the FBS that they will conduct the survey
- Consultation with stakeholders through focus group meetings with representatives of the three focus sectors and gender specialists
- Support for:
 - Design of the questionnaire
 - Design of fieldworker training
 - Training of fieldworkers
 - File design and conversion of data
 - Development of enumeration plan
 - Developing programmes for data analysis
 - Report writing
- Support for valuation of unpaid care work
- Dissemination workshops

Explanatory note

This activity is a priority because the process will extend over a period of at least 18 months. This includes 3-4 months preparation, 10 months carrying out the survey, and 4 months for analysis, report-writing and valuation. Preparation therefore needs to start immediately so that the survey can be completed by the end of the project.

Approval from FBS should be obtained as soon as possible. The consultation and design could then start in the last quarter of 2005.

The morning workshop discussion of 11 August 2005 discussed many of the key methodological issues relating to a time use survey in some detail and came up with provisional recommendations in respect of most of them.

A time use survey can be done on a stand-alone basis or as an add-on to an existing survey such as the labour force survey. There was overwhelming agreement that the first time use survey should be done on a stand-alone basis, but that subsequently it could be done as an add-on to another survey.

There was overwhelming support from the workshop for the FBS doing a national survey. This will facilitate institutionalisation and allow the project to benefit from the existing survey expertise and infrastructure of the institution. If a national survey is not possible, the next best option is a survey in the two pilot districts. This will, however, be

much less advantageous than a national survey on many counts. In particular, it will not allow for valuation or for later use in macro modelling and satellite accounts.

It was agreed that the BS would need technical support provided on a staggered input during the process. This could include both international and national support.

3. BENEFICIARY ASSESSMENT

Objective

The beneficiary assessment will provide information of women and men living in the two pilot districts of Gujarat and Rajanpur of their experience of trying to access/accessing services in the three pilot sectors.

Activities

- Exploration with CIET as to how the GRBI can benefit from their survey
- Exploration with Canadian Development Support Programme on whether they want to partner the GRBI on this activity
- Preparation of TORs
- Appointment of researchers/research institute
- Review of research instruments
- Review of progress reports
- Review of draft final report
- Dissemination workshops in the two districts and at national level

Explanatory note

The beneficiary assessment is not an immediate priority but should not be delayed too long as it will inform district-level work. It will also raise awareness among government officials and people living in the two districts. The assessment should if possible be completed by the middle of 2006 so that it can feed into work with district officials in the second half of the year.

The beneficiary assessment should utilise both quantitative (e.g. survey) and qualitative (e.g. focus group discussions and participatory rural appraisal) methods.

CIET has recently completed one of a series of annual beneficiary assessments which cover all districts. The availability of the CIET survey does not remove the need for a specialised GRBI survey in the two districts as (a) the CIET survey is unlikely to focus on the three key sectors as much as desirable because it covers all sectors; (b) the results are generally not reported with full gender disaggregation; and (c) the raw data are not made available to outsiders. Nevertheless, the GRBI should explore with CIET whether special 'runs' can be commissioned on the two districts and whether the GRBI can have any influence on the questions included in the coming years. The latter, in particular, would involve a form of institutionalisation of beneficiary assessment. In addition, the TORs for the GRBI beneficiary assessment should state that the researchers who do the beneficiary assessment must make recommendations as to how such an assessment can be institutionalised in the two districts.

The Canadian Development Support Programme (CDSP) is focusing on Lodhran and Kasur districts in Punjab. The CDSP project plan makes provision for beneficiary assessments. The GRBI should discuss with the CDSP whether they would like to partner on this activity so as to provide four similar case studies.

A research institute is probably a better option for the service provider for the assessment than an individual.

The activity is likely to take six months.

4. GENDER-AWARE BUDGET SUBMISSIONS IN RESPONSE TO THE BUDGET CALL LETTER

Objective

The gender-aware budget submission is intended ultimately to incorporate gender issues more adequately in policy and related budgets. The shorter-term objective for the first year/s is to make officers responsible for planning and budgeting more aware of gender issues.

Activities

- Review of draft training manual prepared for civil servants
- Schematic outline of revised GRB training manual for civil servants that includes coverage of gender-aware budget submissions and gender budget statements
- Investigation as to whether there is a possibility of influencing 2006/07 budget call circular
- Preparation of suggestions for 2006/07 call circular based on 2005/06 document
- Small one-day workshop in fourth quarter of 2005 for GRBI staff and likely support people to share understanding of what gender-aware budget submissions and gender budget statements entail and to brainstorm approach for training in April 2006
- Preparation of training programme and materials for workshop in second quarter of 2006
- Workshop in second quarter 2006 for officials responsible for planning and budgeting in the three focus ministries and for budget review officers of the Ministry of Finance (i.e. those people who scrutinise the submissions). The main focus of the workshop will be on how to incorporate gender into the submissions submitted in January-March 2006 as a test-run of the GRBI approach. A secondary focus will be deriving gender budget statements as a summary of these submissions.
- Backstopping and mentoring of line ministry officials in completing the amended submissions
- Revision of manual to include examples of work done
- One-day workshop/presentation to senior people in Ministry of Finance and line ministries to demonstrate the work done

- Negotiation with Ministry of Finance staff responsible for budget call circular in the hope of inserting gender in the call circular for 2006/07
- Revision of manual, if necessary, to reflect changes in budget call circular.
- Fourth-quarter 2006 workshop for officials responsible for planning and budgeting in the three focus ministries and for budget review officers of the Ministry of Finance in relation to 2007/08 submissions and gender budget statements.
- Backstopping and mentoring of line ministry officials in completing the submissions and gender budget statements.
- To be decided based on achievements up to this date.

Explanatory note

The main focus of this work will be on the provincial level as it is here that the submission format is most developed and 'friendly'. If it is discovered through the scan of budgetary reforms (see below) that narrative submissions in response to the call circular have been done at federal level, the focus can be expanded. In the second year there could be work at the federal and district level. Activities such as workshop and support will be done separately for the three levels.

A small team which includes project staff and outside experts will assist with this work. One promising idea is to use the researchers responsible for the policy appraisal as part of the backup team. Particular members of the team will be allocated responsibility for particular sectors.

The work proper will commence in the last quarter of 2005 with a workshop for the support team. The work with ministries will commence in the second quarter of 2006. The delay is proposed because (a) it will allow the work with ministries to draw on the learnings from the policy appraisal and (b) because before the second quarter the officials will be tied up in budget preparation for 2006/07.

5. GENDER BUDGET STATEMENTS

Objective

Gender budget statements are intended for tabling on budget day as a summary and 'advertisement' of what government is doing in respect of gender.

Activities

- Review of draft training manual for civil servants* (items marked with an asterisk are the same as those listed for the gender-aware budget submissions in response to the budget call letter)
- Schematic outline of revised GRB training manual for civil servants that includes coverage of gender-aware budget submissions and gender budget statements*
- Small one-day workshop in fourth quarter of 2005 for GRBI staff and likely support people to share understanding of what gender-aware budget submissions and gender budget statements entail and to brainstorm approach for training in second quarter of 2006*

- Preparation of training programme and materials for workshop of second quarter of 2006*
 - Development of versions of the manual for federal and district level focusing only on gender budget statements.
 - Second quarter 2006 workshop for officials responsible for planning and budgeting in the three focus ministries and for budget review officers of the Ministry of Finance (i.e. those people who scrutinise the submissions). The major part of the workshop will focus on how to incorporate gender into the submissions submitted in January-March 2006 as a test-run. A secondary focus is how to prepare gender budget statements from the submissions.
 - Revision of manuals to include examples of work done
 - One-day training of team who will assist with gender budget statements at the district level
 - One-day training of team who will assist with gender budget statements at the federal level
 - Workshop for district level officials in preparing gender budget statements.
 - Workshop for federal level officials in preparing gender budget statements.
 - One-day workshop/presentation to senior people in Ministry of Finance and line ministries to demonstrate the work done*
 - Negotiation with senior financial officials at all three levels of government for agreement on the way in which the gender budget statements will be tabled on budget day
 - Fourth-quarter workshop for officials responsible for planning and budgeting in the three focus ministries and for budget review officers of the Ministry of Finance in relation to 2007/08 submissions and gender budget statements.
 - Backstopping and mentoring of line ministry officials in completing the submissions and gender budget statements (partly duplicates step in submissions)
- Further steps to be decided based on achievements up to this date.

Explanatory note

This tool has a very strong relationship with the gender aware budget submissions. Many of the activities listed above thus overlap.

At the provincial level the development of gender budget statements will entail producing a summary of the gender-aware budget submissions according to a pre-decided format. At the federal and district level gender budget statements will be produced in the first year without first going through the step of responding to submissions. This approach is chosen because the format of budgets at district and federal level are less 'friendly' for GRB purposes.

The support team for the provincial level will be the same as the support team for budget submissions. The members of the support team for the other two levels could consist of different people, but all teams should include project staff.

6. GENDER-AWARE MACRO-ECONOMIC MODEL

Objective

The gender-aware macro-economic model is intended to influence the overall economic framework in terms of which more detailed budget decisions are made.

Activities

- Discussion with the Planning Commission whether there is any possibility of their adopting a new model.
- Negotiation with the Planning and Development (P&D) as to whether the National Expert can be involved in discussions as they develop their computable general equilibrium (CGE) model.
- Ongoing involvement of the Planning Commission representative as part of the reference group for the time use survey.
- Discussion with PIDE as to whether they are interested in developing the gender aspect of their model further and, if so, whether there is any (small) amount of financial or other support that would encourage this.

Explanatory note

There are a variety of macro-economic models in Pakistan. The model used by the Planning Commission is the one which has the most impact on government budgets and planning. The Commission's model is, unfortunately, not of the CGE variety and thus not easily susceptible to incorporation of gender. The Pakistan Institute of Development Economics has a CGE model and staff have already attempted using this for gender analysis. The Social Policy Development Centre (SPDC) has a third model which the National Expert previously used to do some gender modelling. This model is proprietary and so not available to the project. The SPDC model is not of the CGE variety. P&D is planning to commence work in 2006 on developing their own CGE model.

Adaptations of CGE models take two basic forms: (a) disaggregation by sex of the labour factor and (b) addition of the unpaid care economy as a further 'sector'. The second aspect is only possible if and when time use data are available. It will thus not be possible within the timeline of the GRBI.

This tool therefore does not seem to be a priority for the GRBI. Nevertheless, the door should not be closed completely as some activity could develop towards the end of the project's life or soon after. In particular, a participant from the Planning Commission attended the planning session for the time use survey and seemed to be very interested on how they could use the data. This person should be kept informed on an on going basis on the GRBI work. PIDE could also be encouraged to develop their work further.

7. GENDER-AWARE PUBLIC EXPENDITURE TRACKING SURVEY

Objective

The gender-aware public expenditure tracking survey is intended to indicate the extent to which allocations at the federal level reach men and women, girls and boys.

Activities

- Decision as to which programmes should be subject to a tracking survey within each of the three priority sectors
- Drafting of TORs
- Appointment of consultants
- Review of draft instruments
- Review of progress reports
- Review of draft final report
- Dissemination workshop/s with priority sectors

Explanatory note

Public expenditure tracking surveys to date have focused on government efficiency in general rather than gender in particular. The tracking often stops at the facility level such as a school or clinic. At that point it is not necessarily clear whether male or female will benefit. In Pakistan this distinction can be relatively easily made in respect of girls' and boys' schools (although there are some indications that parents sometimes send girls with their siblings to boys' schools). There are also some allocations, such as in respect of education stipends or provision of contraception, that could be 'labelled' as gender expenditures. An emphasis on certain of these expenditures could run the danger of going against the overall principle stated above of focusing on mainstream expenditure.

The tracking surveys should be postponed until completion of the gender-aware policy appraisals. The results of the policy appraisals can then be used to see for which particular programmes it would be useful and feasible to conduct a public expenditure tracking survey. The tracking surveys would thus realistically commence in the second quarter of 2006 at the earliest. A separate consultant would probably need to be appointed for each sector where relevant types of expenditure are to be tracked. The surveys should be completed within six months of the starting date.

8. BENEFIT INCIDENCE ANALYSIS

Objective

Benefit incidence analysis combines household survey data on access to particular services with data on the cost of delivering such services to provide estimates of the extent to which government expenditure reaches individuals from different groups, such as male and female.

Activities

- Obtaining questionnaire for Pakistan Social and Living Standards Measurement Survey (PSLSMS)
- Examination of questionnaire to check that it contains the necessary questions to allow benefit incidence analysis
- Purchase of data from the FBS
- Data analysis and report writing
- Dissemination workshop/s for stakeholders from the three sectors

Explanatory note

The results of the PLSMS are expected shortly. This large-scale household survey was conducted by the Federal Bureau of Statistics (FBS). Although the questionnaire for the survey is not yet publicly available, it is very likely that it will indicate access to key services within the three priority sectors of Health, Education and Population. This activity could thus commence as soon as the questionnaire and raw data from the survey are made available by the FBS.

The analysis is desk-based. The overwhelming bulk of the work involves manipulation of data. The National Expert has previously undertaken benefit incidence analysis and could do the work associated with this tool. He should be able to complete the work within a period of two months of commencing. If we assume, conservatively, that the data become available by the beginning of the first quarter of 2006, the analysis should be complete within this same quarter.

9. SCAN OF BUDGET AND RELATED REFORM PROCESSES

Objective

The objective of the scan is to provide background information which will inform decisions about other activities such as the development of submissions in response to the budget call circular.

Activities

- Develop TORs
- Review draft final report

Explanatory note

The proposed scan will describe the main features of budgetary and planning reforms in Pakistan since 2000. It will be based on a combination of documentary review and interviews with key informants. The exercise is intended to inform the GRBI planning for the development of submissions in response to the call circular and gender budget statements. It should therefore be completed in the early part of the fourth quarter of 2005. The scan is necessary because of contradictory reports on what has happened and is happening currently.

The scan will assist in suggesting ways in which the GRBI can be ‘mainstreamed’ and institutionalised. Where, for example, the scan indicates that training is happening for an initiative such as the medium term budget framework, the project can negotiate to include sessions on gender within the general training.

The scan could be done by either the National Expert or outsourced to an expert in public finance.

10. UNPACKING THE BUDGET

Objective

'Unpacking' of the budget is intended to provide a macro overview of the shape and likely impact of the government budgets on male and female. It is intended, in particular, to provide coverage beyond the three priority sectors chosen for the GRBI.

Activities

- Develop TORs
- Conduct analysis
- Review draft final report
- Dissemination

Explanatory note

The 'unpacking' will primarily cover federal and provincial budgets as the necessarily consolidated information on district budgets is not available and separate examination of each district budget is beyond the scope of the exercise. Within each level, the analysis will look at both the development and recurrent budgets. The report will include a short description for each sector as to how the sector functions are divided between the different levels. This description will include the district level.

The 'unpacking' will discuss gender-specific allocations but will avoid their becoming the central focus.

The National Expert has the knowledge and experience to conduct this exercise. It is seen as a priority project.

11. ANALYSIS OF CIVIL SERVICE EMPLOYMENT

Objective

The objective of this analysis is to highlight the differential benefit derived by males and females from expenditure on employment of civil servants.

Activities

- Develop TORs
- Conduct analysis
- Review draft final report
- Dissemination

Explanatory note

In the budget overall as well as within each sector and level, salaries and related expenditures usually account for a significant part of the budget. The main emphasis of the GRBI is on how the government budget affects 'ordinary' – and especially poor – women and men, girls and boys rather than those employed by government. Nevertheless, the gender patterns in civil service employment are important not only in terms of the direct benefits enjoyed by those employed, but also because the presence of

women in decision-making and implementing positions can affect what is delivered and how it is delivered.